

February 23, 2024

Attn: Rusty Whisenhunt, P.E.
Director of Public Utilities
City of Lawton

Project Name: Ellsworth Spillway Rehabilitation – PU 2312

Subject: Recommendation for Rejection of Bids

Dear Rusty,

The bids received on February 20, 2024, for the subject project have been reviewed and it is recommended that bid from Shimmick Construction Company Inc. be rejected. The bid tabulation is attached, and details of the evaluation are as follows:

- The Bid Checklist was filled in and all documents required for the checklist were included with bid package.
- Only one bid was received and the unit cost and lump sum prices for bid items were significantly more than engineer's estimate, indicating a non-competitive bidding situation with unreasonable prices.

Please let us know if you have any questions or need more information,

Regards,



Arun Srinivasan, P.E.
Project Manager

979-450-9785
Arun.srinivasan@jacobs.com

PU2312 Ellsworth Spillway Rehabilitation

Engineer's Estimate					Shimmick Construction				
Item #	Est. QTY	Description	Unit Price	Item Total	Item #	Est. QTY	Description	Unit Price	Item Total
1	1	Mobilization and Demobilization	\$1,200,000.00	\$1,200,000.00	1	1	Mobilization and Demobilization	\$2,500,000.00	\$2,500,000.00
2	1	Work Change Directive Allowance	\$1,500,000.00	\$1,500,000.00	2	1	Work Change Directive Allowance	\$1,500,000.00	\$1,500,000.00
3	1	Inspection and Testing	\$250,000.00	\$250,000.00	3	1	Inspection and Testing	\$2,600,000.00	\$2,600,000.00
3.B	1	Inspection and Testing (Allowance)	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	3.B	1	Inspection and Testing (Allowance)	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00
4	1	Ground Penetrating Radar	\$90,700.00	\$90,700.00	4	1	Ground Penetrating Radar	\$10,040.00	\$10,040.00
5	50	Pressure Grouting	\$2,700.00	\$135,000.00	5	50	Pressure Grouting	\$6,800.00	\$340,000.00
6	1	Survey	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	6	1	Survey	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
7	1	As-Builts	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	7	1	As-Builts	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
8	1	Phase 1 Cofferdamming	\$52,500.00	\$52,500.00	8	1	Phase 1 Cofferdamming	\$3,700,000.00	\$3,700,000.00
9	1	Phase 2 Cofferdamming	\$63,200.00	\$63,200.00	9	1	Phase 2 Cofferdamming	\$4,500,000.00	\$4,500,000.00
10	1	Phase 3 Cofferdamming	\$49,300.00	\$49,300.00	10	1	Phase 3 Cofferdamming	\$2,600,000.00	\$2,600,000.00
11	1	Repair Full Phase 1 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flows.	\$52,500.00	\$52,500.00	11	1	Repair Full Phase 1 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flows.	\$310,000.00	\$310,000.00
12	1	Repair full Phase 2 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flow.	\$63,200.00	\$63,200.00	12	1	Repair full Phase 2 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flow.	\$450,000.00	\$450,000.00
13	1	Repair full Phase 3 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flow.	\$49,300.00	\$49,300.00	13	1	Repair full Phase 3 Cofferdam damaged by Spillway Flow.	\$310,000.00	\$310,000.00
14	10100	Concrete Demolition for Phase 1 of the Spillway Rehabilitation.	\$40.00	\$404,000.00	14	10100	Concrete Demolition for Phase 1 of the Spillway Rehabilitation.	\$35.00	\$353,500.00
15	3500	Surface Grinding for Phase 1 of the Spillway	\$12.00	\$42,000.00	15	3500	Surface Grinding for Phase 1 of the Spillway	\$15.00	\$52,500.00
16	6570	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 1 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$41.00	\$269,370.00	16	6570	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 1 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$125.00	\$821,250.00
17	1	Hydro-Demolition Mockup	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	17	1	Hydro-Demolition Mockup	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00
18	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for All Work in Phase 1	\$2,770,000.00	\$2,770,000.00	18	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for All Work in Phase 1	\$9,527,000.00	\$9,527,000.00
19	1	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchors in Phase 1	\$2,550,000.00	\$2,550,000.00	19	1	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchors in Phase 1	\$5,100,000.00	\$5,100,000.00
20	1	Strip Drains in Phase 1	\$32,000.00	\$32,000.00	20	1	Strip Drains in Phase 1	\$65,000.00	\$65,000.00
21	435	Relief Drains in Phase 1	\$38.00	\$16,530.00	21	435	Relief Drains in Phase 1	\$170.00	\$73,950.00
22	14100	Concrete Demolition for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$40.00	\$564,000.00	22	14100	Concrete Demolition for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$35.00	\$493,500.00
23	7050	Surface Grinding for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$12.00	\$84,600.00	23	7050	Surface Grinding for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$15.00	\$105,750.00
24	3125	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$41.00	\$128,125.00	24	3125	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 2 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$190.00	\$593,750.00
25	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for all Work in Phase 2.	\$3,330,000.00	\$3,330,000.00	25	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for all Work in Phase 2.	\$6,250,000.00	\$6,250,000.00
26	1	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchors in Phase 2	\$3,060,000.00	\$3,060,000.00	26	1	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchors in Phase 2	\$3,100,000.00	\$3,100,000.00
27	1	Strip Drains in Phase 2	\$38,000.00	\$38,000.00	27	1	Strip Drains in Phase 2	\$65,000.00	\$65,000.00
28	435	Relief Drains in Phase 2	\$38.00	\$16,530.00	28	435	Relief Drains in Phase 2	\$170.00	\$73,950.00
29	11750	Concrete Demolition for Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$40.00	\$470,000.00	29	11750	Concrete Demolition for Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$35.00	\$411,250.00
30	625	Surface Grinding of Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$12.00	\$7,500.00	30	625	Surface Grinding of Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$20.00	\$12,500.00
31	6570	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$41.00	\$269,370.00	31	6570	Hydro-Demolition for Phase 3 of the Spillway Rehabilitation	\$125.00	\$821,250.00
32	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for All Work in Phase 3	\$2,600,000.00	\$2,600,000.00	32	1	Concrete Repair and Construction for All Work in Phase 3	\$8,000,000.00	\$8,000,000.00
33	1	Non-Prestressed Rock	\$2,390,000.00	\$2,390,000.00	33	1	Non-Prestressed Rock	\$4,000,000.00	\$4,000,000.00
34	1	Strip Drains in Phase 3	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	34	1	Strip Drains in Phase 3	\$65,000.00	\$65,000.00
35	435	Relief Drains in Phase	\$38.00	\$16,530.00	35	435	Relief Drains in Phase	\$170.00	\$73,950.00
36	100	Spillway Concrete Allowance	\$700.00	\$70,000.00	36	100	Spillway Concrete Allowance	\$1,000.00	\$100,000.00
37a	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 1	\$3,500.00	\$70,000.00	37a	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 1	\$7,500.00	\$150,000.00
37b	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 2	\$3,500.00	\$70,000.00	37b	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 2	\$8,500.00	\$170,000.00
37c	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 3	\$3,500.00	\$70,000.00	37c	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 3	\$6,500.00	\$130,000.00
37d	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 4	\$3,500.00	\$70,000.00	37d	20	Non-Prestressed Rock Anchor Allowance Type 4	\$10,500.00	\$210,000.00
38	570	10 Inch Diameter Anchor Consolidation Grouting and Redrilling	\$356.00	\$202,920.00	38	570	10 Inch Diameter Anchor Consolidation Grouting and Redrilling	\$178.00	\$101,460.00
39	600	8 Inch Diameter Anchor Consolidation Grouting and Redrilling	\$350.00	\$210,000.00	39	600	8 Inch Diameter Anchor Consolidation Grouting and Redrilling	\$174.00	\$104,400.00
40	1	Pump Station building retrofit, new roof, new hatches, and associated work.	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00	40	1	Pump Station building retrofit, new roof, new hatches, and associated work.	\$600,000.00	\$600,000.00
41	1	Site grading on east side of spillway	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	41	1	Site grading on east side of spillway	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00
42	5000	Riprap Installation	\$40.00	\$200,000.00	42	5000	Riprap Installation	\$65.00	\$325,000.00
43	1000	Aggregate Bedding Beneath Riprap	\$20.00	\$20,000.00	43	1000	Aggregate Bedding Beneath Riprap	\$45.00	\$45,000.00
44	1	Seeding and Final Soil Stabilization, Sod Stake In Place	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	44	1	Seeding and Final Soil Stabilization, Sod Stake In Place	\$60,000.00	\$60,000.00
45	1	Engineer's Field Office	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00	45	1	Engineer's Field Office	\$120,000.00	\$120,000.00
46	1	Engineer's Field Office Furnishing Allowance	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00	46	1	Engineer's Field Office Furnishing Allowance	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00
47	110	Anchor Proof Test	\$1,000.00	\$110,000.00	47	110	Anchor Proof Test	\$2,700.00	\$297,000.00
Total Amount Bid				\$24,150,175.00	Total Amount Bid				\$61,585,000.00
Twenty-Four Million One Hundred Fifty Thousand One Hundred Seventy Five Dollars and Zero Cents					Sixty-One Million Five Hundred Eighty-Five Thousand Dollars				

PU2312 Ellsworth Spillway Bid Tab		
Project Number	Engineer's Estimate	Contractor 1 - Shimmick
Total Base Bid	\$24,150,175.00	\$61,585,000.00
Additional time after NTP		