



November 9, 2023

Joseph Painter, PE
Director of Engineering
City of Lawton
212 SW 9th Street
Lawton, OK 73501

RE: City Wide Pavement Rehabilitation Project
Project No. PW2301
Recommendation of Award

Dear Mr. Painter

EST has reviewed all four (4) of the bids received for the above referenced project. Ellsworth Construction OKC LLC Dba A-Tech Paving; Schiralli Construction Corp; T&G Construction, Inc.; and Rudy Construction Co., all submitted bids for this project. After review of the bids from all companies, the following summary of review and recommendations is provided.

EST Inc recommends the award of the construction contract for the City-Wide Pavement Rehabilitation Project, City Project No. PW2301 to Ellsworth Construction LLC. After a thorough evaluation of the submitted proposals, and careful consideration of the relevant factors, it is EST Inc.'s professional opinion that Ellsworth Construction LLC is the most competitive bidder for this project with a low bid of \$1,548,624.50. A summary of the bids is provided in the table below, and the detailed bid tabulation is attached. All four (4) responsive bids were checked for errors and none were found.


Bidder	Total Bid
Engineers Estimate	\$2,077,309.30
Ellsworth Construction	\$1,548,624.50
Schiralli Construction	\$1,687,136.06
T&G Construction	\$1,895,678.56
Rudy Construction	\$2,351,899.00

Ellsworth Construction OKC LLC Dba A-Tech Paving is located in Oklahoma City. The bid total amount was lower than the Engineer's estimate of \$2,077,309.30.

Sincerely,

Richard Brent Frank, P.E.
EST Inc.



			Engineer's Estimate		Ellsworth Construction		T&G Construction		Schiralli Construction		Rudy Construction	
			UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QUANTITY										
TACK COAT	GAL	6,954	\$4.50	\$31,293.00	\$4.15	\$28,859.10	\$8.72	\$60,638.88	\$6.16	\$42,836.64	\$7.00	\$48,678.00
SUPERPAVE, TYPE S4(PG 64-22 OK)	TON	4,130	\$138.00	\$569,940.00	\$110.75	\$457,397.50	\$138.25	\$570,972.50	\$138.40	\$571,592.00	\$190.00	\$784,700.00
SUPERPAVE, TYPE S5(PG 64-22 OK)	TON	3,775	\$140.00	\$528,500.00	\$114.00	\$430,350.00	\$143.15	\$540,391.25	\$147.42	\$556,510.50	\$195.00	\$736,125.00
SUPERPAVE, TYPE S3 (PATCH)(PG 64-22 OK)	TON	1,000	\$250.00	\$250,000.00	\$210.15	\$210,150.00	\$325.13	\$325,130.00	\$269.91	\$269,910.00	\$260.00	\$260,000.00
COLD MILLING PAVEMENT	SY	81,754	\$4.00	\$327,016.00	\$3.15	\$257,525.10	\$2.33	\$190,486.82	\$1.70	\$138,981.80	\$4.00	\$327,016.00
MANHOLES ADJUST TO GRADE	EA	4	\$1,575.00	\$6,300.00	\$998.00	\$3,992.00	\$3,721.95	\$14,887.80	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00	\$1,000.00	\$4,000.00
MOBILIZATION	LSUM	1	\$106,310.00	\$106,310.00	\$72,000.00	\$72,000.00	\$108,898.80	\$108,898.80	\$52,150.27	\$52,150.27	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00
TRAFFIC STRIPE (MULTI-POLY.) (4"WIDE)	LF	49,104	\$1.00	\$49,104.00	\$1.45	\$71,200.80	\$1.22	\$59,906.88	\$0.72	\$35,354.88	\$1.25	\$61,380.00
CONSTRUCTION TRAFFIC CONTROL	LSUM	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00	\$17,150.00	\$17,150.00	\$24,365.63	\$24,365.63	\$13,800.00	\$13,800.00	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00
Contingency (10%)			\$188,846.30									
			\$2,077,309.30		\$1,548,624.50		\$1,895,678.56		\$1,687,136.09		\$2,351,899.00	
AS READ			\$2,077,309.30		\$1,548,624.50		\$1,895,678.56		\$1,687,136.09		\$2,351,899.00	

**BID SCHEDULE
TEN STREETS RESURFACING PROJECT
CITY PROJECT #PW2301**

ROADWAY		PAY ITEMS				
ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION		UNIT	QUANTITY	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
407(B)7300	TACK COAT	R-25	GAL	6,954	\$4.50	\$31,293.00
411(C)1430	SUPERPAVE, TYPE S4(PG 64-22 OK)	R-26	TON	4,130	\$138.00	\$569,940.00
411(D)1530	SUPERPAVE, TYPE S5(PG 64-22 OK)	R-26	TON	3,775	\$140.00	\$528,500.00
411(H)1900	SUPERPAVE, TYPE S3(PATCH)(PG64-22OK)	R-26, R-40, 1, 2	TON	1,000	\$250.00	\$250,000.00
412 3100	COLD MILLING PAVEMENT	R-30, 3	SY	81,754	\$4.00	\$327,016.00
612(A)3200	MANHOLES ADJUST TO GRADE		EA	4	\$1,575.00	\$6,300.00
					SUBTOTAL	\$1,713,049.00

CONSTRUCTION		PAY ITEMS				
ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION		UNIT	QUANTITY	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
641 2110	MOBILIZATION		LSUM	1	\$106,310.00	\$106,310.00
					SUBTOTAL	\$106,310.00

TRAFFIC		PAY ITEMS				
ITEM NO.	DESCRIPTION		UNIT	QUANTITY	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
856(A)8200	TRAFFIC STRIPE(MULTI-POLY.)(4" WIDE)	TS-24	LF	49,104	\$1.00	\$49,104.00
880(J)7110	CONSTRUCTION TRAFFIC CONTROL	TC-25, TC-25a, C-2	LSUM	1	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00
					SUBTOTAL	\$69,104.00

CONTINGENCY (10%)						\$188,846.30
ENGINEERING ESTIMATE					BID DATE: NOVEMBER 03, 2023	\$2,077,309.30

38

11/1/2023

